

Convenors: The Revd. Father E. J. Yarnold, S.J.  
The Revd. Dr. R. J. Halliburton.

Standing

Members: The Very Revd. the Dean of Christ Church  
The Right Revd. B. C. Butler, O.S.B.  
The Revd. Professor H. Root  
The Revd. J. W. Charley.

Report of Proceedings

1. The Subcommission was set up after the Venice conference in September 1970 and was asked to examine "the notion of sacrifice in the Eucharist in Anglican and Roman Catholic theology".
2. In the autumn of 1970, two draft papers were prepared, one on "The Anglican Doctrine of the Eucharistic Sacrifice", and the other on "The Sacrifice of the Mass" (a Roman Catholic view). (Papers 1 and 2).
3. These were circulated and formed the basis for discussion at a meeting in Oxford on January 12th, 1971, which was attended by all members of the Subcommission with the exception of Professor Root. Professor Macquarrie was also in attendance.

At this meeting, it was noted that (a) the paper on Anglican theology should have mentioned the Archbishops' reply to Apostolicae Curae (1897); an extract from this statement relating to the Eucharistic sacrifice is accordingly appended. (Paper 1A.)

It was also suggested that a written statement from the Revd. J. Charley, representing Evangelical views on the eucharistic sacrifice would be much appreciated.

4. The Revd. J. Charley accordingly submitted his paper (Paper 5). Meanwhile, the Subcommission was glad to receive Bishop Butler's "Reflections on the Eucharistic Sacrifice" (Paper 3(a)) and Father Yarnold's "Eucharistic Sacrifice" (an attempt to propound the doctrine without using the term "sacrifice" - Paper 4).
5. On the receipt of Mr. Charley's paper, the convenors, after consultation with the Dean of Christ Church, proposed three further papers, one representing conservative opinions in Roman Catholic theology (composed by Bishop Butler - Paper 3(b)), another on the "Eucharistic Sacrifice in the New Testament" by Father Yarnold, relating to the first paragraph of Mr. Charley's paper (Paper 7); and the third, an attempt to meet some of the difficulties relating to the "once for all" aspect of the death of Christ and the Eucharistic sacrifice (by Dr. Halliburton - Paper 6).

The Subcommission has been unable to meet in full since the January meeting, However, at a meeting between the convenors and the Dean of Christ Church on June 1st, it was proposed that a report be sent to the International Commission, consisting of the following items:

- (a) A report of the proceedings of the Subcommission since its constitution in September 1970.
- (b) A collection of the papers written by members of the Subcommission, including Dr. Halliburton's on "The Eucharistic Sacrifice in the Caroline Divines" (Paper 8); Father Yarnold's comments on the Revd. Julian Charley's paper (Paper 9); and the latter's comments on other papers (Paper 10); together with an extract from the report of a conference held at Poringland in April, relating to the Eucharistic Sacrifice (Paper 11).

contd./....

- (c) A schema on the Eucharistic Sacrifice for discussion at the Windsor meeting of the International Commission.

7. At the same meeting in June, it became clear that certain points of disagreement had become evident and were in need of further discussion. The main points of disagreement would seem to be:

(i) What is meant by the term "ephhapax" (as used in the Epistle to the Hebrews)? Mr. Charley urges in his paper that if sacrificial language is to be used about the Eucharist, then amongst other things, it is important that the "ephhapax" emphasis of Hebrews, (as in the Cranmerian liturgy) should be retained, i.e. that the "once for all" aspect of the death of Christ should not be lost when discussing the nature of the Eucharistic Sacrifice. Bishop Butler comes some way towards dealing with this problem in his discussion of Christ as the "sacrament of the eschaton", as does Father Yarnold in paragraphs 2 - 4 of his paper; and Dr. Halliburton deals specifically with this aspect of the death of Christ in paragraphs 3, 4 and 5 of his paper. But a variety of misunderstandings over this term may be contributory to our present disagreements.

(ii) What is meant by the term "propitiatory"? (as used by Trent of the sacrifice of the Mass). The idea that one may "propitiate" God by the Eucharistic action can (in certain contexts and with certain notions of what is meant by propitiation) lead to the suggestion that the Eucharist is a "work" and bring forth the charge of "Pelagianism". There is however a prayer in the 1552 Book of Common Prayer which requests (at the Eucharist, after the Communion) "that we and all they whole Church may obtain remission of our sins and all other benefits of His passion" on account of "the merits and death of Thy Son Jesus Christ and through faith in His Blood", suggesting that at the Eucharist, we are asking benefits for the whole Church, though we are wholly unworthy to receive them. There is considerable interest in this question among the 17th century Anglican divines, some of whom seem anxious to reach agreement with their Roman Catholic contemporaries as to what they really feel is meant by the notion of propitiation. A clarification of this notion today may well further assist our mutual understanding. (See Paper 8 for a summary of 17th century Anglican teaching).

(iii) At what moment in the Eucharistic action can the sacrifice be said to take place? Bishop Butler in his second paper (3(b)) notes that Roman Catholics believe that the Eucharistic Sacrifice "occurs" simultaneously with the "conversion" of the bread and the wine. Mr. Charley proposes that "it is in the act of communicating", the Church reintegrated and reappropriated by the one means of grace, is made a living sacrifice to God" (and he quotes "Growing into Union" page 191). Father Yarnold has composed a short paper on this subject (Paper 9) and this again would seem a matter which might suitably be debated at the coming conference.

I beg to submit therefore a short "schema", composed on the basis of our discussions this year, which I trust may be of use in our deliberations at Windsor this September.

R.J.HALLIBURTON.