

Anglican Ordinations: an
assessment by a sub-group of
English ARC

INTRODUCTION

1. In his letter of July 13 1985 to the co-chairmen of ARCIC II, Cardinal Willebrands recalled that in their Common Declaration of May 29th 1982 Pope John Paul II and Archbishop Runcie included among the tasks of the new Commission the need "to study all that hinders the mutual recognition of the ministries of our two Communion". The possibility of such mutual recognition is set firmly in the context of the whole process of reconciliation between the two Communion. He recalled, too, that ARCIC I had affirmed that, in its judgement, the consensus it had achieved on the Eucharist and the Ministry put the issue of the Roman Catholic Church's judgement on Anglican Ordinations into a new context. Towards the end of his letter he wrote:

"If at the end of this process of evaluation (of the Final Report of ARCIC I) the Anglican Communion as such is able to state formally that it professes the same faith concerning essential matters where doctrine admits no difference and which the Roman Catholic Church also affirms are to be believed and held concerning the Eucharist and the Ordained Ministry, the Roman Catholic Church would acknowledge the possibility that in the context of such a profession of faith the texts of the Ordinal might no longer retain that "nativa indoles" which was at the basis of Pope Leo's judgement. This is to say that, if both Communion were so clearly at one in their faith concerning the Eucharist and the Ministry, the context of this discussion would indeed be changed."

2. On behalf of English ARC we were asked to begin a comparative study of the Roman Catholic and Church of England ordination rites, in order to determine - assuming that the consensus on the Eucharist and the Ministry reached by ARCIC I is affirmed by our two Communion - to what extent these rites are consistent with the doctrine on these two issues set out in the Final Report, and how far the Church of England rites satisfy the criteria of validity now required by the Roman Catholic Church. We think that a long answer to these questions requires a detailed examination of the rites. A short answer to the question of validity can be given by showing that the Church of England rites omit nothing which is now indispensable from a Roman Catholic point of view. We shall set out the short answer first, then the long.

Our examination is confined to the two contemporary rites of the Church of England, namely those of the 1662 Book of Common Prayer and the 1980 Alternative Service Book. We have not made a study of the 1952 rite, on which Pope Leo based his judgement, because the question we were asked to examine concerns the sufficiency of the rites in use today.

THE SHORT ANSWER

In this short answer a comparative study is made of the ordination rites for the three orders of bishops, priests and deacons. The texts of the relevant ordination prayers are set out in parallel columns. The paragraphs indicated by a line in the margin are those regarded as essential for validity in the Roman rite, and the equivalent sections in the 1662 and ASB rites. The short answer concludes with five observations.

The ordination of a bishopRoman rite

God the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ, Father of mercies and God of all consolation, you dwell in heaven, yet look with compassion on all that is humble. You know all things before they come to be; by your gracious word you have established the plan of your Church.

From the beginning you chose the descendants of Abraham to be your holy nation. You established rulers and priests, and did not leave your sanctuary without ministers to serve you. From the creation of the world you have been pleased to be glorified by those whom you have chosen.

So now pour out upon this chosen one that power which is from you, the governing Spirit whom you gave to your beloved Son, Jesus Christ, the Spirit given by him to the holy apostles, who founded the Church in every place to be your temple for the unceasing glory and praise of your name.

Father, you know all hearts. You have chosen your servant for the office of bishop. May he be a shepherd to your holy flock, and a wise priest

1662

Almighty God and most merciful Father, who of thine infinite goodness hast given thine only and dearly beloved Son Jesus Christ, to be our Redeemer and the Author of everlasting life; who, after that he had made perfect our redemption by his death, and was ascended into heaven, poured down his gifts abundantly upon men, making some Apostles, some Prophets, some Evangelists, some Pastors and Doctors, to the edifying and making perfect his Church: Grant, we beseech thee, to this thy servant such grace, that he may evermore be ready to spread abroad thy Gospel, the glad tidings of reconciliation with thee; and use the authority given him, not to destruction, but to salvation; not to hurt, but to help; so that as a wise and faithful servant, giving to thy family their portion in due season, he may at last be received into everlasting joy; through Jesus Christ our Lord, who with thee and the Holy Ghost liveth and reigneth, one God, world without end.

ASB

We praise and glorify you, almighty Father, because you have formed throughout the world a holy people for your own possession, a royal priesthood, a universal Church.

We praise and glorify you because you have given us your only Son Jesus Christ to be the Apostle and High Priest of our faith, and the Shepherd of our souls.

We praise and glorify you that by his death he has overcome death; and that, having ascended into heaven, he has given gifts abundantly to your people, making some apostles; some prophets; some evangelists; some pastors and teachers; to equip them for the work of ministry and so build up his body.

And now we give you thanks that you have called this your servant, whom we consecrate in your name, to share this ministry entrusted to your Church.

Send down the Holy Spirit upon your servant N. for the office and work of a bishop in your Church.

Almighty Father, fill this your servant with the grace and power which

blameless in your sight, ministering to you night and day; may he always gain the blessing of your favour and offer the gifts of your holy Church. Through the Spirit who gives the grace of high priesthood grant him the power to forgive sins as you have commanded, to assign ministries as you have decreed, and to loose every bond by the authority which you gave to your apostles. May he be pleasing to you by his gentleness and purity of heart, presenting a fragrant offering to you, through Jesus Christ, your Son, through whom glory and power and honour are yours with the Holy Spirit in your holy Church, now and for ever.

Receive the Holy Ghost for the office and work of a Bishop in the Church of God, now committed unto thee by the imposition of our hands; In the Name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost. Amen. And remember that thou stir up the grace of God which is given to thee by this imposition of our hands, for God hath not given us the spirit of fear, but of power, and love, and soberness.

to your apostles, that he may lead those committed to his charge in proclaiming the gospel of salvation. Through him increase your Church, renew its ministry, and unite its members in a holy fellowship of truth and love. Enable him as a true shepherd to feed and govern your flock; make him wise as a teacher, and steadfast as a guardian of its faith and sacraments. Guide and direct him in presiding at the worship of your people. Give him humility, that he may use his authority to heal, not to hurt; to build up, not to destroy. Defend him from all evil, that as a ruler over your household and an ambassador for Christ he may stand before you blameless, and finally, with all your servants, enter your eternal joy.

Note

In the consecration of bishops there is a variation in practice, but we do not see this as raising any question of validity. The Roman rite of 1948 implied that for a valid consecration it was sufficient for one bishop to lay on hands and say the ordination prayer. The 1968 rite says that, with the principal consecrator, the co-consecrators lay on hands, and recite the part of the prayer essential for the validity. Canon 1014 allows a dispensation from the obligation for there to be at least two co-consecrators. In the 1662 rite all the bishops present lay on hands, the Archbishop alone says the prayer. In the ASB rite the Notes specify that "bishops must be ordained by at least three other bishops, joining together in the act of ordination, of whom one shall be the archbishop of the province or his deputy." The rubrics in the service are as in 1662: the archbishop alone says the prayer.

Accept our prayers, most merciful Father, through your Son Jesus Christ our Lord, to whom, with you and the Holy Spirit, belong glory and honour, worship and praise, now and for ever.

Come to our help, Lord, holy Father, almighty and eternal God; you are the source of every honour and dignity, of all progress and stability. You watch over the growing family of man by your gift of wisdom and your pattern of order. When you had appointed high priests to rule your people, you chose other men next to them in rank and dignity to be with them and to help them in their task; and so there grew up the ranks of priests and the offices of levites, established by sacred rites.

In the desert you extended the spirit of Moses to seventy wise men who helped him to rule the great company of his people. You shared among the sons of Aaron the fullness of their father's power, to provide worthy priests in sufficient number for the increasing rite of sacrifice and worship. With the same loving care you gave companions to your Son's apostles to help in teaching the faith: they preached the Gospel to the whole world.

Lord, grant also to us such fellow workers, for we are weak and our need is greater.

Almighty Father, grant to this servant of yours the dignity of the priesthood. Renew within him the Spirit of holiness. As a co-worker with the order of bishops may he be faithful to the ministry that he receives from you, Lord God, and be

Almighty God and heavenly Father, who of thine infinite love and goodness towards us hast given to us thy only and most dearly beloved Son Jesus Christ, to be our Redeemer and the Author of everlasting life; who, after he had made perfect our redemption by his death, and was ascended into heaven, sent abroad into the world his Apostles, Prophets Evangelists, Doctors and Pastors, by whose labour and ministry he gathered together a great flock in all the parts of the world, to set forth the eternal praise of thy holy Name: For these so great benefits of thy eternal goodness, and for that thou hast vouchsafed to call these thy servants here present to the same office and ministry, appointed for the salvation of mankind, we render unto thee most hearty thanks, we praise and worship thee; and we humbly beseech thee, by the same thy blessed Son, to grant unto all, which either here or elsewhere call upon thy holy Name, that we may continue to show ourselves thankful unto thee for these and all thy other benefits; and that we may daily increase and go forward in the knowledge and faith of thee and thy Son, by the Holy Spirit. So that as well by these thy Ministers, as by them over whom they shall be appointed thy Ministers, thy holy Name may be for ever glorified, and thy blessed kingdom enlarged; through the same

We praise and glorify you, almighty Father, because you have formed throughout the world a holy people for your own possession, a royal priesthood, a universal Church.

We praise and glorify you because you have given us your only Son Jesus Christ to be the Apostle and High Priest of our faith, and the Shepherd of our souls.

We praise and glorify you that by his death he has overcome death; and that, having ascended into heaven, he has given his gifts abundantly, making some, apostles, some, prophets, some evangelists; some, pastors and teachers; to equip your people for the work of ministry and to build up his body.

And now we give you thanks that you have called these your servants, whom we ordain in your name, to share this ministry entrusted to your Church.

Send down the Holy Spirit upon your servant N for the office and work of a priest in your Church.

Almighty Father, give to these your servants grace and power to fulfil their ministry among those committed to their charge; to watch over them and care for them; to absolve and bless them in your name, and to proclaim the gospel of your salvation. Set them among your people to offer with them

to others a model of right conduct.

May he be faithful in working with the order of bishops, so that the words of the Gospel may reach the ends of the earth, and the family of nations, made one in Christ, may become God's one, holy people.

We ask this through our Lord Jesus Christ, your Son, who lives and reigns with you and the Holy Spirit, one God, for ever and ever.

thy Son Jesus Christ our Lord, who liveth and reigneth with thee in the unity of the same Holy Spirit, world without end.

Receive the Holy Ghost for the office and work of a priest in the Church of God, now committed unto thee by the imposition of our hands. Whose sins thou dost forgive, they are forgiven; and whose sins thou dost retain, they are retained. And be thou a faithful dispenser of the Word of God, and of his holy Sacraments; In the Name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost. Amen.

spiritual sacrifices acceptable in your sight and to minister the sacraments of the new covenant. As you have called them to your service, make them worthy of their calling. Give them wisdom and discipline to work faithfully with all their fellow-servants in Christ, that the world may come to know your glory and your love.

Accept our prayers, most merciful Father, through your Son Jesus Christ our Lord, to whom, with you and your Holy Spirit, belong glory and honour, worship and praise, now and forever.

Roman rite

Almighty God, be present with us by your power. You are the source of all honour, you assign to each his rank, you give to each his ministry.

You remain unchanged, but you watch over all creation and make it new through your Son, Jesus Christ, our Lord: he is your Word, your power and your wisdom. You foresee all things in your eternal providence and make due provision for every age. You make the Church, Christ's body, grow to its full stature as a new and greater temple. You enrich it with every kind of grace and perfect it with a diversity of members to serve the whole body in a wonderful pattern of unity.

You established a threefold ministry of worship and service for the glory of your name. As ministers of your tabernacle you chose the sons of Levi and gave them your blessing as their everlasting inheritance. In the first days of your Church under the inspiration of the Holy Spirit the apostles of your Son appointed seven men of good repute to assist them in the daily ministry, so that they themselves might be more free for prayer and preaching. By prayer and the laying on of the hands the apostles entrusted to those chosen men the ministry of serving at tables.

Almighty God, giver of all good things who hast been pleased to call these thy servants unto the office of Deacons in thy Church: make them, we beseech thee, O Lord, to be modest, humble and constant in their administration; to have a ready will to observe all spiritual discipline; that they, having always the testimony of a good conscience, may continue ever stable and strong in thy Son our Saviour Jesus Christ, to whom with thee and the Holy Spirit be all honour and glory, for ever and ever.

Take thou authority to execute the office of a deacon in the Church of God, committed unto thee; In the Name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost. Amen.

Take thou authority to read the Gospel in the Church of God, and to preach the same, if thou be thereto licensed by the bishop himself.

We praise and glorify you most merciful Father, because in your great love of mankind you sent your only Son Jesus Christ to take the form of a servant; he came to serve and not to be served; and taught us he who would be great among us must be the servant of all; he humbled himself for our sake, and in obedience accepted death, even death on a cross; therefore you highly exalted him and gave him the name which is above every name.

And now we give you thanks that you have called these your servants, whom we ordain in your name, to share this ministry entrusted to your Church.

Send down the Holy Spirit upon your servant N for the office and work of a deacon in your Church.

Almighty Father, give to these your servants grace and power to fulfil their ministry. Make them faithful to serve, ready to teach, constant in advancing your gospel; and grant that, always having full assurance of faith, abounding in hope, and being rooted and grounded in love, they may continue strong and steadfast in your Son Jesus Christ our Lord; to whom with you and the Holy Spirit, belong glory and honour, worship and praise, now and for ever.

Roman rite

Lord, look with favour of this servant of yours, whom we now dedicate to the office of deacon, to minister at your holy altar.

Lord, send forth upon him the Holy Spirit, that he may be strengthened by the gift of your sevenfold grace to carry out faithfully the work of the ministry. May he excel in every virtue: in love that is sincere, in concern for the sick and the poor, in unassuming authority, in self-discipline, and in holiness of life. May his conduct exemplify your commandments and lead your people to imitate his purity of life. May he remain strong and steadfast in Christ, giving to the world the witness of a pure conscience. May he in this life imitate your Son, who came, not to be served but to serve, and one day reign with him in heaven.

We ask this through our Lord Jesus Christ, your Son, who lives and reigns with you and the Holy Spirit, one God, for ever and ever.

OBSERVATIONS

1. In the ordination of deacons we recognise one difficulty. In the 1662 form for the making of a deacon there is no reference to the conferring of the Holy Spirit, a requirement laid down by Pius XII in 1947, and endorsed by Paul VI in 1968. The Apostolic Constitution of the latter year, approving the new rites for the ordination of deacons, presbyters and bishops, makes it clear that the matter of each rite is the laying on of the bishop's hands - done in silence before the consecratory prayer - and the form is the consecratory prayer, of which the paragraphs indicated in the texts set out above "belong to the essence and are consequently required for validity". This lack in the 1662 rite was seen as a weakness, though not a fatal defect, by many Anglicans long before the ASB Ordinal rectified the situation in the Church of England.

The difficulty is real for those in deacon's orders, whether temporary or permanent. But the effect on subsequent presbyteral orders is not invalidating. For, first, the requirement of diaconate as a preliminary to presbyterate seems to have been the result of several centuries of development.* Secondly, even when the clerical *cursum honorum* was established, presbyteral ordination received without previous deacon's orders (*ordinatio per saltum*) was held not to be invalid: the higher order contained the lower (St Thomas, *Summa*, Suppl. xxxv.5). So too, St Ambrose seems to have been ordained bishop 8 days after his baptism without receiving diaconal or presbyteral orders.+

- * The Council of Nicaea (canon 2), quoting 1 Tim 3.6-7, forbade the ordination of neophytes to the presbyterate or episcopate. Canon 10 of the Council of Sardica (342 A.D., Hefele-Leclercq i.790) regards the lectorate, diaconate and presbyterate as necessary "steps" towards the episcopate. Canon 80 of the apostolic canons repeats this prohibition, though allowing that there can be exceptions "according to divine grace". In these three sources it appears that the intermediate orders are needed as a time of trial before the episcopate.
- + Paulinus relates (*Vita*, 9) that Ambrose, "baptizatus itaque fertur omnia ecclesiastica officia implesse, atque octavo die episcopus ordinatus est". According to the traditional view the words imply that during the week intervening between baptism and ordination Ambrose received at least diaconate and presbyterate. This interpretation is refuted by B. Fischer, "Hat ambrosius von Mailand in der Woche zwischen seiner Taufe und seiner Bischofskonsekration andere Weihen empfangen?", in *Kuriakon* (*Quasten Festschrift*), ed. P. Granfield & J.A. Jungmann, Munster 1970, ii.527-531). Fischer believes that Ambrose's episcopal ordination without intervening orders was a case of the "divine grace" spoken of in the Apostolic Canons.

2. In the rites for the ordination of bishops and priests, 1662 differs from the other two, in so far as in 1662 the formula for the giving of the Holy Spirit is addressed to the candidate, while in the other two it takes the form of an epiclesis within a prayer addressed to the Father. However, the difference is not so marked as it might seem, because the formulas for each of the orders are preceded by prayers addressed to the Father, asking for grace to be given to the ordinands. A similar prayer precedes the formula used in the making of a deacon, likewise addressed to the candidate.

3. We note that the form of the sacrament is, if anything, more explicit in both 1662 and the ASB than in the Roman rite.

4. Our conclusion to this short answer is that, prescinding from the difficulty we have noted with regard to the 1662 form for the making of a deacon, if the wording of the Roman Catholic rites is considered sufficient for the valid conferring of orders, that of the Church of England rites is also adequate. We note that the Church of England has not doubted the validity of Roman Catholic ordinations, and that Roman Catholic priests, having become Anglicans, have not been ordained in the Church of England. The 1662 Ordinal, in its Preface, restricts the exercise of ministry to those who have been admitted to their function by the use of that Ordinal, or who have had formerly episcopal consecration or ordination.

5. Having given this short answer, we proceed to a more detailed study of the relevant rites, so that a full presentation of the understanding of each of the three orders in our two Communion can be given.

PART TWO
THE LONG ANSWER

We now present a more detailed analysis of the texts of the Ordinals in order to verify the conclusion reached in the short answer. The first section is an examination by Fr. Edward Yarnold of the Ordination Rites in the Book of Common Prayer. This followed by Sr. Cecily Boulding's study of the ASB rites. Canon Roger Greenacre concludes the detailed study with an examination of the modern rites of Ordination in the Roman Catholic Church. Because of the appointment of Canon Hugh Wybrew as Dean of St. George's Cathedral, Jerusalem, Canon George Carey was asked to join the group and has contributed the introduction and conclusion, as well as contributing to the discussion.

We want to draw special attention to the fact that it has not been our intention to study in depth the meaning of the concept of 'validity' within our two Communion or even to consider what it ought to mean today. Our agreed starting point, rather, was the theology of ARCIC I and we have endeavoured to address ourselves to the question: 'Is the theology of our Ordination rites consonant with that of these Agreed Statements?'

I. ANGLICAN ORDINALS - 1662

A. STRUCTURE

ARCIC sets out some of the essentials of the ordination rite (Ministry 14-16; Elucidation 3):

1. A sacramental act by which the Holy Spirit is given, and which involves recognition and authorization.
2. Within the context of the Eucharist.
3. Bishop's prayer for the gift of the Holy Spirit.
4. Laying on of hands by bishop.
5. Other bishops also lay on hands when a bishop is ordained.
6. Presbyters share in the imposition of hands when a presbyter is ordained.

The 1662 rite for the ordering of a priest consists of the following parts:

- a. Presentation of candidate.
- b. Litany.
- c. Collect, readings, bishop's homily.
- d. Examination of candidates by the bishop.
- e. Hymn invoking the Holy Spirit sung by the congregation, led by the bishop.
- f. Bishop's prayer of thanksgiving.
- g. Laying on of hands by bishop and priests, with prayer "Receive the Holy Ghost...."
- h. Delivery of bible, accompanied by charge "Take authority...."
- i. Creed.
- j. Holy Communion.
- k. Last collects.

For the ordering of a bishop the same outline is followed, with some changes: a is omitted; b is transferred to a position before d; c is followed by the King's Mandate and the Oath of Obedience to the Archbishop; f is a prayer for the candidate rather than a prayer of thanksgiving; in g only the bishops lay on hands; in h the charge does not refer to authority, but says "Give heed unto reading, exhortation and doctrine"; i is not prescribed.

For the ordering of a deacon the same outline is found as for the ordering of a priest, with a few variations: the reading of the Gospel is deferred until after h; in g the formula "Receive the Holy Ghost" is replaced by h, "Take authority to execute the office of a deacon"; only the bishop lays on hands; i is not prescribed; the hymn invoking the Holy Spirit is not prescribed.

Thus ARCIC's elements 1-6 are present, except for the ordering of a deacon, where there is neither a hymn invoking the Holy Spirit, nor the formula "Receive the Holy Spirit."

B. CONTENT

ARCIC I (Ministry, Eluc. 6), in a passage which Cardinal Willebrands quotes, suggested that the "new context" against which Anglican Orders should be reappraised was constituted by the Commission's agreements on "the sacramental presence of Christ and the sacrificial dimension of the eucharist, ... priesthood, ordination, and apostolic succession". We shall examine the doctrinal implications of the 1662 ordination rites under these five heads.

1. Eucharistic presence

For a statement of belief in the real presence one would have to turn to the Holy Communion service in which the forms of ordering and consecration are set (just as the contemporary RC rites of ordination express an explicit doctrine of eucharistic presence only in the words of the Mass). The BCP refers to eucharistic presence in the prayers before communion: "Grant us ... so to eat the flesh of thy dear Son Jesus Christ, and to drink his blood"; "Grant that we receiving these thy creatures of bread and wine, according to thy Son our Saviour Jesus Christ's holy institution, in remembrance of his death and passion, may be partakers of his most blessed Body and Blood." However the words permit, and even favour, a receptionist interpretation: in the words of administration the communicant is told to "Take and eat this" (mere bread?), "and feed on him in thy heart by faith, with thanksgiving". One can perhaps speak of strong and weak versions of receptionism. The weak version would deny the objective presence of the Body and Blood of Christ, making their presence the result of our faith. This view, which is explicitly rejected by ARCIC (Euch. 8), cannot be said to be the doctrine of the C. of E., as it is incompatible with Article XXVIII: "the Body and Blood of Christ is given, taken and eaten". The strong version of receptionism would not make the presence dependent on the communicant's faith, but would connect the presence with the act of receiving rather than with the species themselves.

It must however be said that ARCIC, though insisting that Christ's presence precedes our faith (at least logically if not temporally), and that the bread and wine "become" Christ's body and blood (though not by a "material change" : Eluc. 6), seems concerned not to condemn the "strong" view that this "becoming" takes place when the believers feed upon the body and blood "in their hearts by faith" (Eluc. 7).

2. Eucharistic sacrifice

ARCIC's preferred expression for eucharistic sacrifice is "memorial" (anamnesis), which is explained as: (a) the proclamation of Christ's atoning work; (b) an act by which this work is made effective in the life of the Church; (c) thanksgiving for God's mercies; (d) a means of entreating the benefits of Christ's passion on behalf of the Church; (e) an action in which the Church enters into the movement of Christ's self-offering.

For the equivalent of this theology of eucharistic sacrifice one must examine the BCP's service of Holy Communion, which is an integral part of the form for ordering a priest or a bishop. (a) The prayer said immediately before communion recalls the "full, perfect, and sufficient sacrifice, oblation, and satisfaction" of which the

Eucharist is said to be a "memorial". (b) The present effectiveness of the anamnesis is expressed in the first pre-communion prayer, that "our sinful bodies may be made clean by his body, and our souls washed through his most precious blood". (c) Thanksgiving is expressed in the Preface with its preceding dialogue, both of which follow the traditional pattern. (d) If ARCIC's phrase "entreating the benefits of his passion" means to plead the merits of Christ before the Father, this idea is explicitly expressed in the prayer said after communion: "...most humbly beseeching thee to grant, that by the merits and death of thy Son Jesus Christ, and through faith in his blood, we and all thy whole church may obtain remission of our sins, and all other benefits of his passion". (e) ARCIC's "enter into the movement of his self-offering" finds its nearest equivalent in the same post-communion prayer in BCP: "...mercifully to accept this our sacrifice of praise and thanksgiving... And here we offer and present unto thee, O Lord, ourselves, our souls and bodies, to be a reasonable, holy and lively sacrifice unto thee." These clauses express a movement of self-offering on the part of the communicants, which is seen as the fruit of "the merits and death of thy Son Jesus Christ". It is true that the BCP omits any reference to the Church's sharing in Christ's offering of his own sacrifice, but neither does ARCIC state this idea explicitly.

3. Priesthood

The 1662 ordination rites throughout use the word "priest" to refer to the second order of ministry. The word in itself need not carry sacrificial or sacral overtones, as it could be seen as a translation of presbuteros rather than hieruus. However the priest's tasks are defined in terms which include the sacral. The third question the bishop asks of the candidate for the priesthood contains a clause containing the faithful administration of the sacraments; and at the laying on of hands the bishop says, "Receive the Holy Ghost for the Office and Work of a Priest... Whose sins thou dost forgive, they are forgiven ... And be thou a faithful dispenser of the Word of God, and of his holy Sacraments."

Nevertheless there is no reference to the priest being the minister through whom the unrepeatable sacrifice of Christ is offered day by day in an unbloody manner by the Church (cf. Trent DS 1740-1741). It has however to be said that this idea is not present in ARCIC either, where the application of the word "priest" to ordained ministers is justified (1) by his recitation of Jesus' words of institution and his presiding at and distribution of Holy Communion rather than by any function of sacrificing performed by the priest, and (2) by the fact that they are "representatives of the whole Church in the fulfilment of its priestly vocation of self-offering to God as a living sacrifice" (Min.13).

However the main weight of ARCIC's exposition of ordained ministry is not carried by the concept of sacrificial priesthood. The purpose of ordained ministry is said to be to serve the priesthood of the faithful, by acting as "a focus of leadership and unity" (Min.7), and to "enable all the people to use the gifts of the Spirit which they have received for the enrichment of the Church's common life" (Intr.6). This ministry of service of the priesthood of the faithful takes the threefold form of proclaiming and teaching God's word, exercising pastoral care, and celebrating the sacraments (Min.6, cf.7-12).

The promotion of the unity of the local flock is implied in the BCP rite by several references to the "edifying" or "edification" of the Church: in the Litany, the Bishop's words addressed to the Archdeacon, in the collects for each of the three orders, in the Bishop's first question to the candidates for the diaconate, in the reading from Ephesians 4, and in the prayer before the laying on of hands for the priesthood, which speaks of the ordinands as called to "the same Office and Ministry" as the apostles and others by whose ministry Christ "gathered together a great flock in every part of the world". The three functions of a priest of which ARCIC speaks feature also in the BCP. Proclaiming the word: at the laying on of hands the ordinand is bidden to be "a faithful Dispenser of the Word of God, and of his sacraments". celebrating the sacraments: the handing over of instruments (the Bible) follows immediately, during which the Bishop says: "Take thou Authority to preach the Word of God, and to minister the holy Sacraments in the Congregation, where thou shall be lawfully appointed thereunto". The pastoral function of the priestly office is emphasised in the Bishop's address: "to be Messengers, Watchmen, and Stewards of the Lord; to teach, and to premonish, to feed and provide for the Lord's family; to seek for Christ's sheep that are dispersed abroad, and for his children that are in the midst of this naughty world, that they may be saved through Christ for ever."

4. Ordination

According to ARCIC (Min. 14-16; Eluc. Min. 3), ordination implies:

- a) a call by Christ;
- b) in and through and for the Church;
- c) involving a qualification given by the Holy Spirit;
- d) administered by a designated minister, viz. the bishop;
- e) i.e. by a rite which has a sacramental nature;
- f) and is unrepeatable.

Most of these elements are present in the idea of ordination implied by the BCP rite.

- a) Christ's call is referred to in the Bishop's first question to the candidates for the priesthood ("Do you think in your heart, that you be truly called according to the will of our Lord Jesus Christ?"), and the prayer before hands are laid upon them ("thou hast vouchsafed to call these thy servants");
- b) The ecclesial setting of ordination is implied by the Bishop's address to the candidates for the priesthood, especially the words "The Church and Congregation whom you must serve, is his Spouse, and his Body"; and by the words accompanying the laying on of hands for all three orders, which refer to office and work "in the Church of God".
- c) The work of the Holy Spirit is often referred to, especially in the hymn involving the Holy Spirit (which is led by the bishop) and in the words accompanying the laying of hands upon bishops and priests: "Receive the Holy Ghost". Although

neither the hymn to the Holy Spirit nor the words "Receive the Holy Ghost" are prescribed for use at the ordination of a deacon, for all three orders the Litany contains the prayer that God will pour his grace upon the candidates.

- d) Ordination has to be conferred by the bishop.
- e) sacramentality, in ARCIC's understanding, follows from b), c) and d).
- f) I cannot find references in the BCP to the permanence of ordination (though neither can I find any such reference in the RC rite). However, the permanence of ordination can be inferred from Canon C1 (2) of the C. of E.: "No man who has been admitted to the order of bishop, priest, or deacon can ever be divested of the character of his order."

5. Apostolic Succession

ARCIC explains apostolic succession as "the historical continuity of this church with the apostolic Church and of its bishop with the original apostolic ministry" (Min. 16). This is expressed by the episcopal laying on of hands, because the bishops "are representatives of their churches in fidelity to the teaching and mission of the apostles". The laying of hands by several bishops on the new bishop symbolizes and maintains the communion of the churches "through time and space" (Min. 16).

The preface to the ordinal in the BCP refers explicitly to apostolic succession in terms of the continuation of the threefold orders which existed "from the Apostles" time. In the rites themselves, although there is no explicit mention of apostolic succession, the juxtaposing of the ordination of the candidate with the commissioning of the Apostles seems to imply a doctrine of succession (Consecration of bishops: opening Collect and Archbishop's bidding of the congregation to prayer). Fidelity to the apostolic faith is implied by the insistence on fidelity to Scripture (for Deacons: Litany, interrogation; for Priests: Bishop's address, interrogation, words at laying on of hands and tradition of instruments, penultimate Collects; for Bishops: opening Collect, interrogation, prayer before laying on of hands, penultimate Collect).

C. CONCLUSION

If the BCP rites are examined according to the criteria established by the ARCIC agreements, the only serious defect lies in the fact that at the ordination of a deacon there is no explicit rite for the conferring of the Holy Spirit. The implications of this defect are considered above in Observation 1 to the "Short Answer".

E.J.Y.

II. CONSIDERATION OF THE ORDINAL OF THE ALTERNATIVE SERVICE BOOK IN THE LIGHT OF THE FINAL REPORT OF ARCIC

The Final Report of ARCIC in paras. 14-16 of the statement on Ministry & Ordination, and in para. 3 of the Elucidation of that statement, indicates the essentials required in the ordination rite.

The ASB Ordinal will here be considered in terms of A. Structure, B. Content.

For an analysis of FR's structural requirements, see previous part of this paper, considering the 1662 Ordinal.

A. STRUCTURE

The ASB Rite of Ordination is structured in the following way:-

- preparation;
- ministry of the Word;
- presentation of candidates;
- (for ordination of bishop, preface and declaration of assent;)
- declaration;
- examination;
- prayers: Veni Creator, litany, collect;
- ordinations: first part of prayer;
 - epiclesis with laying-on of hands;
 - conclusion of prayer;
- giving of the New Testament or bible;
- resumption of Eucharistic liturgy with Pax and Offertory.

B. CONTENT

The content of the ASB rite is here analysed under the headings: Context, Origin, Purpose, Means, Duties, Special characteristics. Para. 16 of the Ministry & Ordination Statement of the Final Report states the belief that the new context for the re-appraisal of Anglican Orders is created by the agreement reached on a) the sacramental presence of Christ and the sacrificial dimension of the Eucharist; cf, No.5 below, Duties; b) the nature and purpose of priesthood and apostolic succession; cf, No.2 and 3 below, Origin and Purpose.

1. Context:

FR requires ordained ministry - to be considered within the broader context of ministry in the church;

- to be related to the royal priesthood of all the baptised which it must serve;
- especially at the Eucharist where it is representative of the whole church fulfilling its priestly vocation of self-offering;
- consequently ordination is in, and for, the community, and is an act of the whole church, which takes place in the context of the Eucharist.

ASB Ordinal implies all these things;

- declaration in ordination rite of deacon states that he is called to work with the members of the Church of God;
- ditto in ordination of bishop;
- final blessing at end of ordination Eucharist alludes to the many gifts and ministries among God's people;
- ordination does take place in context of Eucharist;
- explicit consent of people, and their prayer on behalf of candidate, is an integral part of the rite.

2. Origin

FR states - apostolic features of special relationship to Christ, and commission from him to the whole world are significant for Church of all ages;

- episcopate existed from the beginning;
- ordained ministry is thus part of God's design for his people;
- ordained ministry is still God-given now, and such ministers are still called and commissioned by Christ;
- their qualifications are a gift of the Spirit.

ASB implies - the apostolic origin of all ministry in the readings chosen for the ordination liturgy;

- that ordained ministry is part of God's design by restricting ordination to a bishop;
- that all ministry now is still God-given by the wording of the consecratory prayers in ordination.

Purpose

FR states that the purpose of ordained ministry is - to give glory to God by prayer and praise, and surrender to divine grace;

- to bring men into the fellowship of Christ's people;
- to build up the community of the church;
- to express and maintain, the apostolicity and catholicity of the church.

ASB points out - the duty of prayer in liturgy and worship in declaration for ordination to all three ministries;

- examination in all three cases requires a commitment to diligence in prayer;
- priestly declaration refers to duty to witness to the world, and search out the Lord's children in the wilderness of the world;
- bishop's declaration refers to duty to promote the mission of the church throughout the world;
- examination in all three ordinations requires commitment to promote unity, peace and love among the people of the church;
- consecratory prayer for bishops and priests refers to building up of the body, the church;
- apostolicity and catholicity implied in the consecratory prayer for priests, more explicitly stated in that for bishops, and quite explicit in preface to declaration of assent required of bishops.

4. Means:

FR states that the means to achieve these purposes are:

- proclamation of the word;
- preservation of apostolic doctrine;
- being an instrument of reconciliation;
- guidance of the community in its commitment to Christ;
- co-ordination and discernment in the life of the church;
- care of the flock;
- attention to human needs.

ASB covers all these points in the declaration and examination which precede ordination to each of the three ministries.

5. Duties:

FR summarises duties of ordained ministry as "ministry of word and sacrament" which includes:

- fidelity to, and transmission of, the faith;
- presiding at the Eucharist;
- pronouncing absolution;
- baptising, receiving converts, reconciling, and proclaiming forgiveness;
- proclaiming the reconciliation of Christ, especially at the Eucharist;
- being a focus of leadership.

ASB covers all these points in the declaration and consecratory prayer of each ordination rite;

- in the matter of presiding at, and proclaiming the reconciliation of Christ in, the Eucharist, the role of the ordained minister is specified in the declaration for diaconal ordination as "leading the worship of the people, especially in the administration of the Holy Communion"; and in that for priestly ordination as "to preside at the celebration of the Holy Communion";
- the consecratory prayer for priestly ordination includes the petition: "...set them among your people to offer with them the spiritual sacrifices acceptable in your sight, and to minister the sacraments of the New Covenant...";
- the concept of Eucharistic presence, and of the anamnesis of Christ's sacrifice implied in the phrases "spiritual sacrifices" and "sacraments of the New Covenant", can be discerned from:
 - Note 8 of the Notes preceding the Ordinal, which states: Where it is so agreed symbols of the priest's office (chalice and paten) or the bishop's office (pastoral staff) may be presented after the giving of the Bible.
 - Note 2 of the Notes preceding the Order for Holy Communion which states: The president, (who in accordance with the provisions of canon B12, Of the ministry of the Holy Communion, must have been episcopally ordained priest) presides over the whole service. He says the opening greeting the collect, the absolution, the peace, and the blessing; he must himself take the bread and the cup before

replacing them on the holy table, say the eucharistic prayer, break the consecrated bread, and receive the sacrament on every occasion. The remaining parts of the service he may delegate to others.

- The two Eucharistic prayers provided for the Order of Holy Communion: First: ...as we follow his example and obey his command, grant that by the power of your Holy Spirit these gifts of bread and wine may be to us his body and his blood... we remember his offering of himself made once for all upon the cross, and proclaim his mighty resurrection and glorious ascension. As we look for his coming in glory, we celebrate with this bread and this cup his one perfect sacrifice. Accept through him, our great high priest, this our sacrifice of thanks and praise... Second: ...through him accept our sacrifice of praise; and grant that by the power of your Holy Spirit these gifts of bread and wine may be to us his body and blood... Having in remembrance his death once for all upon the cross, his resurrection from the dead, and his ascension into heaven, and looking for the coming of his kingdom, we make with this bread and this cup the memorial of Christ your Son our Lord. Accept through him this offering of our duty and service; and as we eat and drink these holy gifts in the presence of your divine majesty, fill us with your grace and heavenly blessing; nourish us with the body and blood of your Son...

6. Special characteristics

FR delineates the ordained ministry - in the N.T. imagery of servant, herald, ambassador, authoritative representative, teacher, shepherd, steward and example;

- as standing in sacramental relationship to the unique priesthood of Jesus Christ (in the same way that the eucharistic action stands in sacramental relationship to Christ's unique sacrifice) and so most fully seen when the minister is presiding at the eucharist;
- the ordination rite is therefore considered to be of a sacramental nature;
- ordained ministry is therefore of a different realm of the gifts of the Spirit from the royal priesthood of the baptised;
- the spirit seals those consecrated in ordination;
- and this gift is irrevocable;
- priestly ordination illustrates the shared nature of the commission entrusted to them;
- episcopal ordination illustrates that the new bishop and his church are in communion with the rest of the church;
- the bishop is thus the symbol of communion among churches, and of apostolic continuity;
- the bishop's responsibility for oversight is linked to the word of God;
- the ministry is to be modelled on christ's own ministry.

ASB implies, though does not explicitly use, all the N.T. imagery;

- the actual form of the rite, combination of laying-on of hands with essential formula in epiclesis form, indicates sacramental nature of the rite;

- difference between ordained priesthood and royal priesthood of the baptised is implied in the consecratory prayers, the giving of the bible, and the proper preface for the ordination Eucharist;
- the sealing by the Spirit is implied in the prayers of ordination;
- the irrevocable nature of the gift is implied in the consecratory prayers of ordination, and the exhortation to stir up the gift received which concludes the examination;
- the shared nature of the commission received is indicated in the joint laying-on of hands at priestly ordination;
- the role of bishop as symbol and means of communion among churches, and of apostolic continuity is indicated by action of co-consecrators at episcopal ordination;
- the link between oversight and the word of God, and the need to take Christ's own ministry as model, are indicated in the declaration and examination in each ordination rite.

C. CONCLUSION

As indicated in the Introduction, the possibility of a mutual profession of faith which would subsume the Agreed Statements on Eucharist and on Ministry and Ordination provided the context for the present exercise. Those statements have therefore been taken to provide the context in which to assess the ASB Ordinal.

Neither the Ordinal nor the Communion Rite of the ASB seems wholly explicit about the bearing of Eucharistic doctrine on the understanding of priesthood. The sufficiency of their doctrine is however secured if the ASB is interpreted in the light of the ARCIC documents on Eucharist and Ministry, which the General synod of the Church of England affirmed to be 'consonant' with the teaching of the Church of England.

C.B.

III. AN ANGLICAN CRITIQUE OF THE ROMAN CATHOLIC ORDINATION RITES

1) INTRODUCTION

Cardinal Willebrand's letter to the co-chairmen of ARCIC II, dated 13th July 1985, quotes the Common Declaration of the Pope and the Archbishop of Canterbury on 29th May 1982, which assigns to ARCIC II among its other tasks that of studying "all that hinders the mutual recognition of the ministries of our two Communion". Although this use of the phrase "mutual recognition" merely repeats the language of ARCIC I (Ministry and Ordination, para. 17, and Elucidation, para 6), it is clear that the problem of Roman Catholic recognition of Anglican ministry and that of Anglican recognition of Roman Catholic ministry are far from symmetrical. It is for this reason that this Anglican critique takes a different form from the Roman Catholic examination of the Anglican ordination rites. It has now, for example, been considered necessary to demonstrate how all the essential prerequisites for a rite of ordination set out in The Final Report of ARCIC are to be found in the new Roman rites. Anglican difficulties with the Roman rites have usually been on the grounds that they contain "too much" rather than "not enough". To understand this an historical perspective is essential.

2) THE HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

At the historical level it can be quite simply affirmed that Roman Catholic ordinations are already clearly "recognised" by the Churches of the Anglican Communion. The Preface to the 1662 Ordinal states unambiguously : "No man shall be accounted or taken to be a lawful Bishop, Priest or Deacon in the Church of England, or suffered to execute any of the said functions, except he be called, tried, examined, and admitted thereunto, according to the Form hereafter following, or hath had formerly Episcopal consecration or ordination." This is a more tightly drawn rephrasing of the Preface to the previous ordinals which laid down that "no man (not being at this present Bishop, Priest, nor Deacon)" could exercise these ministries unless admitted "according to the form hereafter following." The tightening up was directed at ministers who had not been episcopally ordained, who were now quite explicitly required to obtain episcopal ordination before their ministry could be "recognised"; it did not alter the practice of the Church of England which has invariably allowed former Roman Catholic bishops, priests and deacons to exercise their own ministry in our own Church by a process of authorization without either reordination or conditional ordination. *1

The claim of the English Ordinal (through all its various revisions) that the Orders of Bishop, Priest and Deacon, known in the Church of Christ "from the apostles' time", were now to be "continued, and reverently used and esteemed, in the Church of England" implies, as a necessary element in its claim to continuity, the sufficiency of the Latin ordination rites for preserving this basic continuity. Although in most cases the Evangelical and Reformed Churches have not practised "reordination" of convert Roman Catholic priests, some of their theologians argued for it and there is evidence that the

practice has existed in some places and at some times. There can however be no doubt that the Roman Catholic Church is a Church whose Orders are recognised and accepted by the Churches of the Anglican Communion and that the present discipline of the Church of England, as expressed in its Canons, only makes more fully explicit a policy unchanged since the Reformation.*2

3) TOWARDS A FULLER CONCEPT OF RECOGNITION

It is clear that "mutual recognition" in the mind of ARCIC I and of Cardinal Willebrands must mean more than simply the bare recognition of validity. It is perfectly possible to argue that a given rite is capable of effecting validly the sacrament in question but that it also expresses an unsatisfactory - even an heretical - theology at some points. Anglican recognition of the validity of Roman Catholic ordinations cannot therefore be taken necessarily to imply full Anglican agreement with the theology expressed in Roman ordination rites. At this point it is perhaps worth quoting from the Bonn Agreement of 1931 signed by the authorised representatives of the Old Catholic Churches and the Churches of the Anglican Communion:

1. Each Communion recognises the catholicity and independence of the other and maintains its own.
2. Each Communion agrees to admit members of the other Communion to participate in the Sacraments.
3. Intercommunion does not require from either Communion the acceptance of all doctrinal opinion, sacramental devotion, or liturgical practice characteristic of the other, but implies that each believes the other to hold all the essentials of the Christian Faith.

The text of Article 3 must apply to the ordination rites of both Communions and, by extension, to the Roman Pontifical, which was being used, with hardly any modification, by the Old Catholic Churches at the time. I quote it however to establish the point that for Anglicans at any rate even a fuller recognition of other liturgical rites does not imply the ratification or endorsement for Anglican use of all "doctrinal opinion, sacramental devotion, or liturgical practice" characteristic of the other Church. A simple example is the direct invocation of saints - which occurs in the Litany in the Roman ordination rites. In 1958 a Committee of the Lambeth Conference reported on The Book of Common Prayer as a bond between Anglicans, together with suggestions as to the principles of Prayer Book revision. In that Report it made three lists -

(i) Features in the Book of Common Prayer which are essential to the safeguarding of the unity of the Anglican Communion; (ii) Features in the Book of Common Prayer which are most effective in maintaining the traditional doctrinal emphasis of the worship and witness of the Anglican Communion; (iii) Suggested modifications or additions for the further recovery of other elements of the worship of the Primitive Church. Item 8 of the second list reads: "The honouring of the Saints without invocation." Since this appears in the second list rather than the first it is clearly regarded as a "doctrinal opinion" and "liturgical practice" of the second order, on which Churches can differ without it affecting full communion.*3. The fact then that the Litany of the Saints and - to give another example -

the anointing with chrism of a new priest's hands and a new bishop's head are not found in the ordination rites of the Church of England need not be seen as in any sense an obstacle to full communion; nor must absence be interpreted as condemnation.

The degree of harmony between the ordination rites of our two communions required by this fuller concept of recognition is touched upon briefly in the reply of the Co-Chairmen of ARCIC II (January 14th, 1986) to the letter addressed to them by Cardinal Willebrands (July 13th, 1985):

If at the end of this process the authorities of our two communions are able, on the basis of the statements agreed by ARCIC-I, to recognise one another as holding the same faith concerning eucharist and ministry, they will confirm the judgment of our predecessors in ARCIC-I that we now have a new context for the discussion of the mutual recognition of ministries. In that case the problem at the heart of Apostolicae Curae, namely the need for a common faith concerning eucharist and ministry, would be resolved. That resolution would furnish us with a clear perspective with which to view the Ordinals used by our two communions.

4) THE THEOLOGY OF THE NEW ROMAN RITES

All that really needs to be added at this juncture is some examination of the extent to which the reformed Roman rites of ordination promulgated by Pope Paul VI in 1968 (i) reflect the new thinking of Vatican II, (ii) support the agreement on ministry and ordination reached by ARCIC I and (iii) represent a genuine convergence with theological and liturgical changes in the Church of England.

(i) The new thinking of Vatican II. A study of the changes in emphasis in Roman Catholic theology of priesthood and ministry since Trent has been made by John Jay Hughes in the course of his book Stewards of the Lord (Sheed & Ward, London and Sydney, 1970) and more particularly in Chapter 9 The Sacrificing Priesthood. One of the dangers of Apostolicae Curae was that the very narrow and exclusively cultic definition of priesthood found there, which, says Hughes, "does less than justice to the Tridentine doctrine of the ministry" (op. cit., p 202), would provoke from some Anglicans such a vigorous reaction that in the end they would agree with the verdict of Apostolicae Curae that the teaching on ministry of the Roman Catholic Church and the Church of England are mutually incompatible. At the extreme Protestant end of the Conservative Evangelical wing of the Church of England that danger is still a present reality. *4

Most Anglicans however, and not least most Anglican Evangelicals, welcome the more balanced teaching of Vatican II and its reflection in The Final Report of ARCIC; clear evidence of this was given in November 1986 when the General Synod of the Church of England in its formal response to BEM and ARCIC affirmed that the ARCIC statements on the Eucharist and on Ministry and Ordination are "consonant in substance with the faith of the Church of England." Anglicans cannot but welcome the strong emphasis in the documents of Vatican II on the essentially pastoral character of the ordained ministry and the statement that "it is the first task of priests as co-workers of the

bishops to preach the Gospel of God to all men". (Presbyterorum Ordinis, 4). But before drawing attention to some of the more important textual variations introduced into the Roman ordination rites after Vatican II, it is important to emphasise two important changes which form part of the background of those variations and which have substantially reduced the differences between Anglican and Roman Catholic theology. The Roman Catholic Church has now abolished the minor orders and also the subdiaconate (at one time considered, at least by some, as one of the three major orders of priest, deacon and subdeacon) and has made it clear that consecration (now deliberately called ordination) to the episcopate is the sacramental conferring of a distinct order in which resides the fulness of the priesthood and of the Sacrament of Order. Paul VI has also confirmed the judgment of Pius XII that the matter of the Sacrament of Order is the laying on of hands and form is a consecratory prayer - of which certain portions are indicated as essential for validity in the Latin rite.

Not very much needs to be said about the rite of ordination to the diaconate in the present context. Anglicans however will certainly welcome the fact that the Bishop now imposes both hands on the candidate and also the new formula which accompanies the presentation of the Book of the Gospels.

Receive the Gospel of Christ
Whose herald you now are
Believe what you read
Teach what you believe
And practice what you teach.

This replaces the curious formula:

Receive the power to read the Gospel in church
For both the living and the dead.

The changes in the rite of ordination to the priesthood (presbyterate) are more significant. The model homily presents a balanced picture of the participation of the priest in the ministry of Christ as Teacher, Priest and Shepherd. It gives proper but not exclusive emphasis to his eucharistic role in these words:

Your ministry will perfect the spiritual
sacrifice of the faithful by uniting it to
Christ's sacrifice, the sacrifice which is
offered sacramentally through your hands.

The Prayer of Consecration itself contains no mention of the eucharist but does emphasise the proclamation of the Gospel. At the Offertory of the Mass the paten and chalice are handed to the new priest by the bishop with these words:

Accept from the holy people of God the gifts
to be offered to him.
Know what you are doing, and imitate the mystery
you celebrate.
Model your life on the mystery of the Lord's
cross.

This replaces the formula in the old Pontifical which accompanied the porrectio instrumentorum and which at one time was an accepted theological opinion to be the form and matter of the sacrament:

Receive the power to offer sacrifice to God,
and to celebrate Mass both for the living and
for the dead.

The changes in the rite of ordination to the episcopate are also significant. Here again the model homily draws extensively on the theology of Vatican II, while the Prayer of Consecration is taken from the Apostolic Tradition of Hippolytus, a notable ecumenical gesture as this prayer "underlies all the rites of ordination of the Eastern Church" (J'D' Crichton: Christian Celebration: The Sacraments, Geoffrey Chapman, London 1973, p. 143). Moreover all the bishops present lay on hands and not just the two statutory co-consecrators.

(ii) The Final Report of ARCIC. The new rites are of course earlier than ARCIC's Ministry and Ordination text of 1973 and its Elucidation of 1979. Nevertheless the new rites of 1968 give support to the ARCIC agreement, notably in the treatment of the relationship between bishop and presbyter and in the emphasis given to the priority of the word of God and its proclamation. ARCIC presents the celebration of the eucharist by the bishop and the presbyter as intimately linked with the pastoral and teaching ministry. The new rites, by ceasing to use the language of the "power" to offer sacrifice and by integrating the privilege of celebrating the eucharist more organically into the ministry of perfecting "the spiritual sacrifices of the faithful", support what is said in paragraph 13 of Ministry and Ordination. It is interesting to compare this with the Report on Priesthood in the 1968 Lambeth Conference, which says: "The characteristic function delegated by the bishop to a priest is that of presiding at the Eucharist in which all Christians, intimately united with the crucified and risen Lord and with one another, are offered anew to God."

(iii) Liturgical Convergence. The convergences in liturgical structure and in theology between the new Roman rites of ordination and the ASB Ordinal are striking; they are examined in some detail in the accompanying paper by Sister Cecily Boulding. The fact that in the former the laying on of hands takes place in silence before the Prayer of Consecration while in the latter it accompanies the Prayer need cause no difficulty to either Church. Some Anglicans may still feel theologically uneasy with some of the language and some of the ceremonies in the revised Roman rites, but they will have to concede that they have the same problem with language and ceremonies in some of the liturgies of the Anglican Communion.

5) CONCLUSION

Anglicans are accustomed to the distinction, vital to the whole concept of "comprehensiveness", between differences at the level of theology, which are legitimate and even healthy, and differences at the level of faith, which ought not to be tolerated. If the Church of England has always accepted the sufficiency for validity of the former Roman ordination rites, it can only welcome more wholeheartedly the reformed rites of 1968, which have made a positive contribution to substantial agreement between our two Churches on the nature of ordination (lex orandi and lex credendi complementing each other in this field) and are helping to make possible a move forward from a bare (and sometimes grudging) recognition of validity on the part of Anglicans to that fuller recognition which is necessary for the reconciliation of our Ministries and of our Churches.

R.T.G.

FOOTNOTES

- *1 In an historical study The Anglican Ordinal (Alciun Club Collection, no. 53: SPCK, London, 1971), Dr Paul Bradshaw refers (on P.99) to a Commission set up in 1689 to facilitate the acceptance into the ministry of the Church of England of those who had not been ordained according to its rites.

Objections were raised against admitting Roman Catholics without further ordination because, it was claimed, the matter, form and intention of their former ordination were in doubt: hands were not laid upon them and the words, 'Receive the Holy Ghost, whosoever sins,' etc., not said until after their ordination, and the correct intention could never be proved. Others urged caution in condemning Roman Orders because they had always been regarded as valid by the Church of England in the past and because Anglican Orders were ultimately derived from them. Henry Compton, the Bishop of London, then said it was not the validity of their orders that was being questioned, but the sufficiency of the evidence; impostors had often presented themselves for admission to the ministry of the Church of England, claiming Roman Orders, and the Church of Rome was not willing to confirm the doubtful cases. It was therefore proposed that such men should receive conditional ordination.

- *2 of The Canons of the Church of England, (4th edition, 1986);

1

Canon C (of Holy Orders in the Church of England):

The Church of England holds and teaches that from the Apostles' time there have been these orders in Christ's Church: bishops, priests, and deacons; and no man shall be accounted or taken to be a lawful bishop, priest or deacon in the Church of England, or suffered to exercise any of the said offices, except he be called, tried, examined and admitted thereunto according to the Ordinal, or any form of service alternative thereto approved by the General Synod under Canon B 2 or has had formerly episcopal consecration or ordination in some Church whose orders are recognised and accepted by the Church of England.

- *3 Direct invocation of the saints is in fact found in many devotional texts and hymns used by Anglicans. Its omission from the Liturgy itself is therefore not a condemnation of the practice but a recognition that Anglicans cannot agree about it.
- *4 In its pamphlet ARCIC and the Church of England, the Church Society asserted that the Articles of the Church of England "do not teach that Christian ministers are sacrificing priests, but rather preaching elders (presbyters). No reference is made in the ordination service of the Church of England to the offering of sacrifice in the Holy Communion service by the priest; he is not ordained with that intention." The pamphlet therefore argued that the acceptance of ARCIC's teaching would serve to overthrow the historic teaching of the Church of England.

CONCLUSION

This thorough examination of the texts of the ordinals in the light of the Final Report has not only resulted in the conclusion that there are no major theological differences between the ARCIC Statements and ordination rites at present in use in the churches but indicates also that, in the main, they show that there already exists considerable agreement concerning our understandings of the meaning of Ordination. The following points have emerged from this study:

1. That during the last twenty years both Churches have made important alterations to their ordinals which mark a shift in the direction of the theology of ARCIC.(1) In the ASB this consists in the gentle underlining of the sacramental roles of Bishop and Priest in the Church of God. In the newer Roman Catholic rites there is a broadening out of the nature of Priesthood to include pastoral and teaching roles.
2. As both Canon Greenacre and Sr. Cecily observe, a comparison of ASB with the Final Report and the modern Roman Catholic rites reveals important convergences in liturgical structure, language and theology. In each there is a serious commitment to a theology which insists that: a) the ordained ministry serves the Royal Priesthood of the people of God: b) that the Ordained are properly 'marked out' from the baptized and given an Office which is permanent and the Gift of the Spirit for their ministry: c) that the sacramental nature of Episcopal and Presbyteral offices is clearly expressed alongside pastoral and teaching roles. It is true that Sr. Cecily would have liked the eucharistic theology of the ASB to have been more explicit but, as she points out in her conclusion, as long as the Final Report provides an authoritative basis for the interpretation of the theology of the Ordinal there can be little room for ambiguity concerning the nature of ministry. d) that episcopal ordination anchors the newly ordained in the wider church.
3. As Fr. Yarnold indicates, however, the most serious deficiency appears to be that of the omission of the gift of the Spirit to the deacon in the Ordinal of the Book of Common Prayer. This may be caused by the BCP's theology that men are 'made' deacons but 'ordained' priests. This, however, is rectified in the ASB where the bishop lays his hands on each candidate with the words: 'Send down the Holy Spirit upon your servant N for the office and work of a deacon in your church'.
4. Finally, it must be noted that recognition of the rites of Ordination practised does not imply that all doctrinal opinions are thereby ratified and accepted. We must take seriously the widespread theological pluralism in both our Communion and should not expect to find such tight agreement that could suggest that we are one on every theological opinion concerning the nature of Priesthood and that of the Eucharist. What we are able to say boldly is that we are satisfied that all essential doctrines appear to be safeguarded by our new Ordinals.(2) It is our hope that, as our Communion converge even closer in the days to come, such questions that remain will be clarified and finally settled.

It will be recalled that Cardinal Willebrands observes in his letter to the co-chairmen of ARCIC II that 'If both Communions were so clearly at one in their faith concerning the Eucharist and the Ministry, the context of this discussion (viz. concerning the validity of Anglican Orders) would indeed be changed'. It is our opinion that in the light of ARCIC theology, prescinding from the question of apostolic succession, there can no longer be grounds for doubting the validity of priests, or episcopal orders according to any of these rites.

Notes:

- (1) Series 3 Ordinal, pub 1977; authorised 1978. ASB 1980
New Roman Rites 1968
- (2) With the exception, as we have mentioned, of the ordination of deacons according to the BCP.

MEMBERSHIP OF THE ARC SUB-GROUP

Sister Cecily Boulding, O.P.
 The Rev. Canon George Carey (for Part Two only)
 The Rev. Canon Roger Greenacre
 The Rev. Hugh Wybrew (for Introduction and Part One only)
 The Rev. Edward Yarnold, S.J.